# Organizational Commitment of Secondary School Teachers: A Comparative analysis of Gender, Age, Rural and Urban Schools

Nazir Haider Shah\* Azhar Mahmood\*\*

#### **Abstract**

Organizational commitment is considered as an anthology of thoughts that the workers have regarding their job in any organization. This is considered as an important factor that predicts the strength of bond between an employee and his/her organization. The current research study was aimed to check out the difference in organizational commitment with respect to gender, age and location. The study was carried out using a survey method. All the (13764) private secondary school teachers of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were the population of the study. 860 teachers were selected from private secondary schools of Rawalpindi and Islamabad by using stratified disproportionate random sampling technique. In this study, the Organizational Commitment Scale (OCS) was used as a research instrument. It was found that the commitment of female teachers were better than male teachers. It was also found that the rural teachers were more committed as compare to the urban ones. Moreover, the older teachers were found to be more committed than the younger ones.

**Keywords:** Affective commitment, normative commitment continuance commitment organizational commitment, demographic variables,

## Introduction

The workers of an organization are considered as a key to its success. Their commitment to work for the organization can act as a key factor for its progress. Organizational commitment is considered as the thinking of workers to accept the organization and wanting to become part of the organization with zeal and zest (Robbins, 1998). This mentality makes individuals binding with the organization and a wish to be a part of an organization. People with high organizational commitment have wish to work hard, show loyalty and accept the goals and principles of the organization (Tella, et al., 2007). Organizational commitment is also the spiritual connection between an individual and organization which is shown by the commitment of doing

\_

<sup>\*</sup>Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Kotli, AJ&K, Corresponding email: nazirshah786@gmail.com.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Associate Professor, Department of Education, International Islamic University Islamabad azhar.mahmood@iiu.edu.pk.

assigned tasks by the authorities. Hence, it is considered as an important link between employees and the organization (Tsai & Huang, 2008). It is very important factor for an organization because dedicated employees are often keener to sacrifice for the organization as compare to those who have less organizational commitment (Vitell & Singhapakdi, 2008). Furthermore, the employees with higher organizational commitment tend to stay in the organization even though they have an option to work for any other organization (Bhuian & Menguc, 2002; Weihui & Zhao, 2011).

# **Background of the Study**

For school administrators, it is a challenge to have experienced and competent teachers in their institutes. In case of private sector institutions of Pakistan, this challenge has become a headache for the administrators as it is obvious that advertisements for school teachers are being published regularly in various newspapers. In Karachi, Lahore, Rawalpindi/Islamabad and other big cities the teachers have more job opportunities, so they tend to leave the organization as soon as they are offered a new job with better facilities. Hence the problem of leaving the job becomes more severe in high populated areas as compare to less populated areas (Khan & Aziz, 2013). A study was conducted in Rawalpindi and Islamabad to find the intention of teachers to leave the current job showed that teacher turnover intention is a big problem in the institutions of big cities including Rawalpindi and Islamabad (Zahra et al., 2013). In this connection the researcher felt a research gap between organizational commitment and demographic variables. Therefore, it is important to conduct a study to examine the differences in organizational commitment with respect to gender, age and location of private school teachers.

# Statement of the Problem

Organizational commitment of teachers plays very important role in any educational institution. The commitment of teachers who belong to different areas, gender and experience may vary from other teacher. The private schools of Pakistan facing such demographic variation problems. Therefore, the researcher decided to fill the research gap and conduced study on organizational commitment of teachers in terms of age, gender and locality.

# **Objectives**

- 1. To compare the level of organizational commitment of male and female private secondary school teachers.
- 2. To compare the level of organizational commitment of urban and rural private secondary school teachers.
- 3. To compare the level of organizational commitment among age groups of private secondary school teachers.

## Journal of Educational Research, Dept. of Education, IUB, Pakistan (Vol. 24 No. 1) 2021

## Research Questions

- 1. Is there any difference in organizational commitment of teachers regarding gender?
- 2. Is there any difference in organizational commitment of teachers regarding locality of schools?
- 3. Is there any difference in organizational commitment of teachers in term of their age?

## **Literature Reviewed**

This section provides theoretical basis of the current research work.

## Organizational Commitment

Organizational Commitment is considered as a very famous term used by the researchers now a day. It is considered as the level at which the employees are familiar with the organization and want to be part of the organization. This commitment refers to the level at which employees are prepared to work in the organization. Furthermore, the worker's trust in the company's goals and mission is also considered. He/she also desires to continue working in the company utilizing the best of his/her abilities (Singh & Pandey, 2004). Individuals are subject to have psychological constraints in organization (Bashir & Ramay, 2008).

Organizational and personal variables including organizational tenure, age and personality may affect the organizational commitment of the employees (Singh & Pandey, 2004). Therefore, organizational commitment is a state where employees are familiar with the organizational goals and still want to stay in the organization to achieve those goals. The commitment of employees is the psychological wealth that employees possess in the work environment. The researchers consider three types of organizational commitment which are briefly stated as under.

1. Affective commitment: Affective commitment means a sense of recognition of organization (Meyer & Allen, 1991). It is a practice for employees to think, execute and ponder about his/her relationship with the organization (Clugston, 2000). Meyer, et al. (1993) argued that workers who have a higher level of affective commitment in the organization will not only be willing to work because they need to work but also because they are willing to continue working with energy. The relationship between the organization and workers is constructive as the employees with high affective commitment have the same standards as the organization's standards (Shore & Tetrick, 1991). Therefore, it is right to say that the employees who have high affective commitment will stay long in the organization, because they have the will to work for their organization.

- 2. Continuance commitment: Meyer et al. (1993) state that the continuance commitment is a person's perception of the cost of leaving the organization. Hence, Yang (2008) comments that it is an observable fact as the employee signs the contract with the organization after keeping in view the cost effectiveness of the job. It is also related to the experience of work and understanding of the organizational needs by the employees. Nagar (2012) claimed that workers who have high degree of continuance commitment often think that leaving the organization is not easy because they fear of the costs they have to bear after leaving the organization. It may also be due to the fear that they have less job opportunities outside the organization they are working at present. In other words, workers stay in the organization either because they think that they will not be accepted by other organizations or there are no other work options outside the organization. Clugston (2000) argued that employees who have high degree of continuance commitment will stay long in the organization, because they think they must do so for their financial benefits.
- 3. Normative Commitment: Is the commitment to the dedication of an employee with the organization based on ethical considerations (Meyer & Allen, 1997). This is usually the result of socialized practice and due to firmness of an employee on the sense of responsibility. It can be strengthened by the society that develops commitments and tendencies in its individuals (Yang, 2008). It also refers to the thoughts and responsibilities left by workers of the institution. Workers who have normative commitment high believe that it is a right approach to expand their positions in the organization.

Normative commitment can be increased by creating an environment in which the employees sense that they have invested resources and time in the organization, hence it is an obligation to work with full devotion for the institution (Meyer et al., 1993). Workers with highly normative commitments should also be responsible for the benefits they receive from the organization by working hard and continuing to work. The normative dedication and dedication of employees persuades them to stay in the organization because they think they must do it (Clugston, 2000).

# Demographic Variables and Organizational Commitment

Organizational commitment has been studied a lot in terms demographic variables such as income, marital status and gender etc. Keeping in view the current study, following are important demographic variables reviewed by the researchers (Balay et al., 2010).

# Organizational Commitment and Gender Differences

Many researches investigating the impact of gender on organizational commitment. According to Balay et al. the traditional organizations were male organizations hence the women who worked in those organizations were less loyal.

Kargar et al. (2012) has considered the other side of the coin in which the organization where men and women work together efficiency and output levels are related to productivity not the gender of the employees. They also found that at the same time, the organizational commitment chart has also risen. While discovering the reasons this growth they found that there were competitive awareness, professionalism and low absenteeism.

Saifuddin and Nawaz (2012) shows that women tend to work with more commitment as compare to their counterparts. Furthermore, the females are found to be more task oriented when compared with males. The study also discloses that while working in the common environment male workers show better commitment as compare to female workers because they (male workers) views to develop a sense of competitiveness in their minds.

In another study, Kumari and Jafri (2011) studied the organizational commitment of female and male secondary school teachers. Through t-test analysis of data, the study investigated that the female university teachers were more commitment with the organization as compare to male university teachers. Likewise one more study indicated that the female teachers showed more commitment when compared with the male teachers (Zilli & Zahoor, 2012).

# Organizational Commitment and Age Differences

A lot of researches have been done to find the effect of age of employees on their organizational commitment. For instance, a study by Isaiah et al. (2006) argued that age of employees was positively correlated with the organizational commitment. The study also unveils that many employees realize that their working hours basically do not take into account their family needs. Furthermore, the sense of responsibility gradually matures as a person grows. The subsequent job opportunities also decrease. As a result, individuals in the upper age group have more organizational commitments than the recruits. In addition, monetary gains such as wages, pensions, funds and allowances also support this phenomenon (Nawaz & Kundi, 2010).

What is certain is that older workers and young workers interpret and understand work/organization-related experiences and events in different ways, thereby disclosing reports on work/organization methods for different age groups show different interpretations (Weiss & Cropanzano, 1996). There are reports that certain age groups are more fascinated by organizations which inevitably be matched with more productive daily organizational practices (Luchman, et al., 2012). For instance, Kanchana and Panchanatham (2012) explored the differences in the organizational commitment of workers in different age groups (less than 25, 26-35, 36-45, and over 45 years). They pointed out the differences in the organizational commitments of employees in an organization. On the other hand, Naderi (2012) reported that workers in different age groups have no significant differences in organizational commitments,

which shows that no matter how old the workers are, there is no difference in their commitments to workers. The organization in which they work will have no issue of age of their employees.

# Organizational Commitment and School Location (Urban and Rural)

Like many other demographic variables, location of the school may also affect the organizational commitment of the employees. For instance, Kumari and Jafri (2011), Nagar (2012), Raj and Lalita (2013), Zilli and Zahoor (2012), and many other studies have found that teachers belong to the rural areas had better organizational commitment as compare to urban areas. On the other hand, there is no difference found in the commitment in rural and urban teachers (Garipağaoğlu, 2013). Likewise, Suki (2011) pointed out that rural teachers have no difference in the commitment when compared with urban teachers.

# **Research Methodology**

The research was descriptive by nature and survey method was applied to collect the data. All (13,764) private secondary school teachers who are teaching in various secondary schools of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were the population of the study. The researcher selected 860 teachers by applying stratified disproportionate random sampling technique. The lists of private secondary school teachers were obtained from the Educational Officer of the Rawalpindi, Deputy District Education Officers and the Private Education Regularization Administration of Rawalpindi and Islamabad. 860 teachers were selected from private secondary schools of Rawalpindi and Islamabad by using stratified disproportionate random sampling technique. For the collection of data from the respondents the Organizational Commitment Scale (OCS) comprised of eighteen items developed by Meyer and Allen (1997) was used. The researchers personally visited the sample schools and collected data. In order to analyze the data, the researchers used mean, standard deviation t-test and ANOVA tests.

## **Results**

**Table 1**Descriptive Analysis

Variables	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
Urban	442	58.60	10.783
Rural	418	61.28	11.675
Male	328	57.67	10.609
Female	532	61.28	11.499

Table 1 describes that the difference between the mean scores of rural (N=418, M=61.28, SD=11.675) and urban (N=442, M=58.60, SD=10.783) secondary school teachers was 2.68 which showed that the rural teachers were more committed as

compare to the urban teachers. Similarly, Table 1 also shows that the difference between the mean scores of female (N=532, M=61.28, SD=11.499) and male (N=328, M=57.67, SD=10.609) secondary school teachers was 3.61 which indicated that the female teachers were more committed than the urban teachers.

 Table 2

 t-test Analyses: Gender, Urban and Rural

Variables	t-test for Equality of Means		
	t	df	p
Rural and Urban: Organizational Commitment	-3.488	858	.001
Male and Female: Organizational Commitment	-4.595	858	.000

Table 2 indicated that there was a significant difference in the mean scores of female (M=61.28, SD=11.499) and male (M=57.67, SD=10.609) teachers as t (858) = -4.595, p=.000<.05. Hence,  $H_01$  was rejected. Moreover, female teachers presented better scores in organizational commitment as compare to the male teachers. It was also established that a significant difference found in the mean scores of rural (M=61.28, SD=11.675) and urban (M=58.60, SD=10.783) teachers as t (858) = -3.488, p=.001<.05. Hence,  $H_02$  was rejected. Moreover, rural teachers showed significantly better organizational commitment than the urban ones.

**Table 3**Descriptive Statistics of Age

Age groups	N	M	SD
younger than 25	336	61.79	12.177
25-34	396	58.66	10.785
35-44	94	57.83	8.923
45-54	23	59.30	9.167
55 or above	11	66.00	14.656
Total	860	59.90	11.298

Table 3 indicated descriptive analysis of various age groups. The results showed that the teachers with age group 55 years or above (N=11, M=66.00, SD=14.656) showed top organizational commitment while age group of younger than 25 years (N=336, M=61.79, SD=12.177) got second position in this regard. However, age group of 35-44 years (N=94, M=57.83, SD=8.923) showed least organizational commitment when compared with other age groups.

**Table 4** *One Way ANOVA: Age Groups* 

	df	F	Sig.
Between Groups	4		
Within Groups	855	5.263	.000
Total	859		

Table 4 presented the results obtained by using one way ANOVA. It showed that a significant difference found between organizational commitment of teachers and their age as F(4, 855)=5.263, p=.000>.05. Hence,  $H_03$  was rejected. As one way ANOVA showed significant results therefore, the researchers used Post Hoc Tukey to check the difference among different age groups.

**Table 5** *Post Hoc Tucky Test: Age Groups* 

(I) age	(J) age	Mean Difference (I-J)	Sig.
Younger than 25	25-34	3.135 <sup>*</sup>	.002
	35-44	$3.962^*$	.021
	45-54	2.487	.841
	55 or above	-4.208	.735
25-34	35-44	.827	.968
	45-54	648	.999
	55 or above	-7.343	.201
35-44	45-54	-1.475	.980
	55 or above	-8.170	.149
45-54	55 or above	-6.696	.477

Table 5 indicated that a significant difference found between the age of younger teachers than 25 years and 25-34 as p=.002<.05 and the difference was 3.135. Similarly, the teachers who were 25 years old were significantly better than 35-44 years as p=.021<.05 and the difference was 3.962. All the other groups showed no significant variations. This showed that between age of less than 25 to 44 years teachers showed significant variations when their organizational commitment was measured. After the age of 44 years the teachers showed non-significant variations. Hence, it was found that after the age of 44 the teachers became committed to their organization.

#### Discussion

A lot of researches have been done to explore the commitment of employees with their organization. The purpose of conducting such studies may vary across the world. Likewise, this study was designed to explore the difference in the organizational commitment level of male and female teachers working in private schools of

Rawalpindi and Islamabad. The current study concluded that the female teachers were more committed to their organizations when compared with their counterparts. The studies conducted by Mathieu and Zajac (1990) and Mowday et al. (1982) found almost similar results. Both concluded that men use to spend less time and money for their organization when compared with women. Likewise, Loscocco (1990) found that women were proud of their organization and they tend to maintain their status in the organization. Furthermore, the women did their work in more organized way as compare of men who showed less organization in their work. Hence, many clarifications were reported to account the greater commitment of women workers. On the other hand, some studies found no relation between gender differences and commitment to the organization (Billingsley & Cross, 1992; Jonathan, et al., 2013). Previous studies have shown different results, which may be due to differences in culture and topography. Therefore, it can be concluded that compared with male teachers, the commitment of female teachers in private secondary schools is stronger

The second goal is to test the difference between the average scores of the organizational commitments of urban and rural school teachers in the private sector. According to the results of this study the teachers teaching in the rural areas of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were more committed than the teachers working in the urban areas. Zilli and Zahoor (2012) conducted a study which yielded similar results in favour of rural teachers. Likewise, the studies conducted by Raj and Lalita (2013) and Nagar (2012) concluded their results that the urban teachers showed less commitment and left jobs frequently as compared to the rural teachers. In contrast, while exploring the commitment level of rural and urban teachers Suki (2011) and Garipağaoğlu (2013) found no difference. The conclusion is that teachers in rural areas are more determined than teachers in urban areas. This may be because rural teachers have fewer employment opportunities than urban teachers. Therefore, they show loyalty and commitment to the organization.

The third goal of this research was to explore differences in teacher age in terms of organizational commitment. The results of the current study found significant differences between different age groups. In addition, it was also found that when teachers were over 44, they showed greater determination. Jonathan, Darroux, and Massele (2013) also obtained almost similar results. Their research shows that the most loyal people are over 50, while the least loyal people are the youngest (between 21 and 30 years). Therefore, it can be concluded that old people are more loyal than young people. The reason older people invest more in organizations is that they are less enthusiastic about finding new opportunities and moving to new places than younger people. The level of commitment of young teachers was lower than that of older teachers (Jonathan, et al., 2013).

### Conclusion

On the bases of current study result following conclusions were made:

- 1. It is concluded that the female teachers were more committed to the organizations as compare to male teachers. It may be due to less opportunities or they do not like to quit institute due to sense of responsibility.
- 2. It is also concluded that the teachers teaching in the rural areas of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were more committed than the teachers working in the urban areas. The teachers are working in urban areas of Pakistan may has more job opportunities as compare to the teachers of rural areas. That is why they are more committed.
- 3. It is further concluded that old people are more loyal and committed than young teachers. The reason is that the older people invest more in organization in terms of time and commitment on the other hand the young teachers have more opportunities that is why they quit the organization.

## Recommendations

The study yielded that the teacher teaching in the schools located in rural areas of Rawalpindi and Islamabad were more committed to the organization than those who were working in the urban schools. One of the possible reasons of this difference may be due to the fact that the urban school teachers have more opportunities to avail another job than the rural ones. This may allow the urban teachers to quit the current organization to join the new one. To overcome this problem, it is recommended that there may be a unified wages system across rural and urban schools. Furthermore, all the private schools are required to facilitate their employees in a similar way.

The study also found that older teachers were more committed that younger teachers. One of the reasons of their dissatisfaction may be due to search of better opportunities by the young teachers. To overcome this issue, it is suggested that the private school authorities may introduce a system in which the teachers who work for longer period may be benefitted. Furthermore, they are suggested to constitute a grievances committee which may so that the complaints of the employees who want to leave the organization may be incorporated.

### References

- Akintayo, D. I. (2010). Work-family role conflict and organizational Commitment among industrial workers in Nigeria. *JPC*, 2(1), 1-8.
- Balay, R., & İpek, C. (2010). Teachers' perception of organizational culture and organizational commitment in Turkish primary schools. *JWT*, 2(1), 363-384.

- Bashir, S., & Ramay, M. I. (2008). Determinants of organizational commitment: a study of information technology professionals in Pakistan Mohammad Ali Jinnah University, Islamabad. *Behavioral and Applied Management*, 9(2), 21-32.
- Bhuian, S. N., & Menguc, B. (2002). An extension and evaluation of job characteristics, organizational commitment and job satisfaction in an expatriate, guest worker, sales setting. *The Journal of Personal Selling and Sales Management*, 12(3), 1-11.
- Clugston, M. (2000). The mediating effects of multidimensional commitment on job satisfaction and intent to leave. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 21(4), 477-486.
- Cohen, A. (1993). Organizational commitment and turnover: A meta-analysis. *Academy of Management Journal*, *36*(5), 1140-1157.
- Garipağaoğlu, B. C. (2013). Examining organizational commitment of private school teachers. *Journal of Educational and Instructional Studies in the World*, 3(2), 22-28.
- Isaiah, O. U. (2006). Organizational commitment, job redesign, employee empowerment and intent to quit among survivors of restructuring and downsizing. *IBAM*, 4(2), 232-257.
- Jonathan, H., Darroux, C., & Massele, J. (2013). Perceived job satisfaction and its impact on organizational commitment: An empirical study of public secondary schoolteachers in Dodoma, Tanzania. *Journal of Business and Management*, 13(3), 41-52.
- Kanchana, P. N., & Panchanatham, N. (2012). The influence of demographic factors on organizational commitment. *International Journal of Exclusive Management Research*, 2(5), 1-13.
- Kargar, M. (2012). Evaluation of organizational commitment of employees in University; Case Study: Islamic Azad University. *Journal of Basic and Applied Scientific Research (JBASR)*, 2(5), 5017-5021.
- Khan, M., & Aziz, S. A. (2013). Teachers' turnover in private secondary schools of Karachi (Pakistan). *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 14(5), 58-65.
- Kumari, S., & Jafri, S. (2011). Level of organizational commitment of male and female teachers of secondary schools. *Journal of Community Guidance & Research*, 28(1), 37-47.

- Loscocco, K. A. (1990). Reactions to blue-collar work: A comparison of women and men. *Work & Occupations*, 17(2), 152–177.
- Luchman, J. N., Kaplan, S. A., & Dalal, R. S. (2012). Getting older and getting happier with work: An information-processing explanation. *Social Indicators Research*, 108(3), 535–552.
- Martin, A. (2007). Perceptions of organizational commitment, job satisfaction and turnover intentions in a post-merger (Unpublished PhD Dissertation). South African Tertiary Institution.
- Mathieu, J. E., & Zajac, D. M. (1990). A review and meta-analysis of the antecedents, correlates, and consequences of organizational commitment. *Psychological Bulletin*, 108(2), 171-194.
- Meyer, J. P., & Allen, N. J. (1991). A three component conceptualization of organizational commitment. *Human Resource Management Review*, 1(1), 61-98.
- Meyer, J. P., & Allen, N. J. (1997). Commitment in the workplace: Theory, research, and application: Evaluation of measures and analysis of concurrent in time-lagged relations. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 75(6), 710-720.
- Meyer, J. P., Allen, N. J., & Smith, C.A. (1993). Commitment to organizations and occupations: extension and test of a three-component conceptualization. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 78(4), 538-551.
- Mowday, R. T. Porter L.W., & Steers, R.M. (1982). *Employee-Organizational Linkages: The Psychology of Commitment, Absenteeism and Turnover*. New York: Academic Press.
- Naderi, A. N. (2012). Teachers: emotional intelligence, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment. *Journal of Workplace Learning*, 24(4), 256-269
- Nagar, K. (2012). Organizational commitment and job satisfaction among teachers during times of burnout. *VIKALPA*, *37*(2), 43-60.
- Nawaz, A., & Kundi, G. M. (2010). Demographic implications for the eLearning user perceptions in HEIs of NWFP, Pakistan. *EJISDC*, 41(5), 117-129.
- Raj, T., & Lalita (2013). Job satisfaction among teachers of private and government school: a comparative analysis. *International Journal of Social Science & Interdisciplinary Research*, 2(9), 151-158.
- Robbins, S. (1998). *Organizational behavior: Contexts, controversies and applications*. USA: Prentice- Hall Page.

- Saifuddin, Nawaz, A., & Jan, F. (2012). Predicting Job-Satisfaction among the Academicians of Universities in KPK, Pakistan. *IEL*, 2(2), 34-45.
- Shore, L. M., & Tetrick, L. E. (1991). Construct validity study of the survey of perceived organizational support. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 76(5), 637-643.
- Singh, Y., & Pandey, M. (2004). *Principles of organizational behavior*. New Delhi: AITBS Publishers and Distributors.
- Suki, N. (2011). Job Satisfaction and organizational commitment: the effect of gender. *International Journal of Psychology Research*, 6(5), 1-15.
- Tella, A., Ayeni, C. O., & Popoola, S. O. (2007). Work motivation, job satisfaction and organizational commitment of library personnel in academic and research libraries in OYO State Nigeria. *Practice of Library and Philosophy*, 23(3), 106-117.
- Tsai, M. T., & Huang, C. C. (2008). The relationship among ethical climate types, facets of job satisfaction, and the three components of organizational commitment. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 32(4), 565-581.
- Vitell, S. J., & Singhapakdi, A. (2008). The role of ethics institutionalization in influencing organizational commitment, job satisfaction, and esprit de corps. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 17(6), 343-353.
- Weihui Fu, S. P., & Zhao, X. (2011). The impact of ethical behavior and facets of job satisfaction on organizational commitment of Chinese employees. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 32(4), 537-543.
- Weiss, H. M., & Cropanzano, R. (1996). Affective events theory, a theoretical discussion of the structure, causes and consequences of affective experiences at work. *Research in Organizational Behavior*, 54(6), 1-74.
- Yang, J. T. (2008). Effect of newcomer socialization on organizational commitment, job satisfaction, and turnover intention in the hotel industry. *The Service Industry Journal*, 28(4), 429-443.
- Zahra, S., Irum, Z. A., Mir, S., & Chishti, A. (2013). Job satisfaction and faculty turnover intentions: A case of Pakistani universities. *Journal of Business and Management*, 9(2), 83-89.
- Zilli, A. S., & Zahoor, Z. (2012). Organizational commitment among male and female higher education teachers. *Indian Journal of Psychology and Education*, 2(1), 55-60.